### **ORDER SHEET**

# WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

#### Present-

Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal, Hon'ble Chairman & Hon'ble Dr. Subesh Kumar Das, Administrative Member.

# CASE NO. OA 437 of 2020. AMOD PRASAD –Vs-THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

| AMOD PRASAD –Vs-THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.  Serial No. and Order of the Tribunal with signature Office action with date |   |                           |  |  |
|--|---|---------------------------|--|--|
| Serial No. and Date of order.  | Order of the Tribunal with signature                              | and dated signature       |  |  |
| Date of order.   | 2   | of parties when necessary |  |  |
| 1  |   | 3                         |  |  |
| 3  | For the Applicant : Mr. B.K. Halder,                              |                           |  |  |
| 24.12.2020.  | Mr. I. Halder,  |                           |  |  |
|  | Advocates.  |                           |  |  |
|  |   |                           |  |  |
|  | For the State respondent : Mr. S. Ghosh,                          |                           |  |  |
|  | Advocate.   |                           |  |  |
|  | For the Principal Accountant                                      |                           |  |  |
|  | General (A & E) W.B. : Mr. B. Mitra,                              |                           |  |  |
|  | Departmental representative.                                      |                           |  |  |
|  |   |                           |  |  |
|  | Let affidavit of service filed today be kept on                   |                           |  |  |
|  | record.   |                           |  |  |
|  | This application, affirmed on 17 <sup>th</sup> November,          |                           |  |  |
|  | 2020, has been filed by Amod Prasad, a Medical Officer in         |                           |  |  |
|  | the District Hospital, Nadia, challenging the order of            |                           |  |  |
|  | transfer dated 3 <sup>rd</sup> November, 2020 transferring him as |                           |  |  |
|  | Medical Officer to Mekhliganj SDH, Coochbehar, on                 |                           |  |  |
|  | several grounds. It is submitted by Mr. B. Halder, learned        |                           |  |  |
|  | advocate for the applicant, that as the applicant was a           |                           |  |  |
|  | covid patient and now is suffering from gout and is under         |                           |  |  |
|  | treatment at SSKM Hospital, the order of transfer be set          |                           |  |  |
|  | aside and quashed.  |                           |  |  |
|  | Mr. S. Ghosh, learned advocate for the State                      |                           |  |  |
|  | respondents, referring to the application, particularly           |                           |  |  |
|  | paragraph (viii) and prayer "a" thereof, submits that the         |                           |  |  |

## **ORDER SHEET**

|          | AMOD PRASAD. |
|----------|--------------|
| Form No. |              |
|          | Vs.          |

Case No. **OA 437 of 2020.** 

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

| Serial No. and | Order of the Tribunal with signature                        | Office action with date                       |
|----------------|---|---|
| Date of order. | 2   | and dated signature of parties when necessary |
| <del>_</del>   | applicant admittedly was a covid Patient and now is         | 3   |
|                | suffering from gout and therefore, the order of transfer    |   |
|                | be not interfered with. Moreover, it is submitted that as   |   |
|                | transfer is a part of one's service career, no order be     |   |
|                | passed on the application.                                  |   |
|                | Heard learned advocates for the parties.                    |   |
|                | It is evident from paragraph 6 (viii) that the              |   |
|                | applicant "was infected with covid 19 and after             |   |
|                | discharge he is still suffering from acute flare of gout in |   |
|                | post covid". However, in the prayer it has been stated      |   |
|                | that he was a covid patient and has not fully recovered     |   |
|                | from the said disease. We find from the petition that he    |   |
|                | has been released from the District Hospital, Nadia. Since  |   |
|                | admittedly that the applicant was infected with covid-19    |   |
|                | and after recovering was discharged, no order can be        |   |
|                | passed on the application. It requires to be mentioned      |   |
|                | that the Supreme Court in State of U.P and Others – Vs-     |   |
|                | Gobardhan Lal (2004) 11 SCC 402, particularly in            |   |
|                | paragraphs 7 and 8 thereof, has laid down the law that an   |   |
|                | order of transfer, unless it is the outcome of a mala fide  |   |
|                | exercise of power or violative of any statutory provision   |   |
|                | or passed by an authority not competent to do so, cannot    |   |

### **ORDER SHEET**

|          | AMOD PRASAD. |
|----------|--------------|
| Form No. |              |
|          | Vs.          |

Case No. **OA 437 of 2020.** 

THE STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

| Serial No. and Date of order. | Order of the Tribunal with signature<br>2                   | Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary |
|-------------------------------|---|---|
| 1                             | be interfered with. In the instant case the applicant has   | 3   |
|                               | not alleged that the order of transfer was the outcome      |   |
|                               |   |   |
|                               | of a mala fide exercise of power or violative of any        |   |
|                               | statutory provision or passed by an authority not           |   |
|                               | competent to do so. Therefore, no order is passed on the    |   |
|                               | application. The application is disposed of.                |   |
|                               | Since for circumstances beyond control, the                 |   |
|                               | Registry is unable to furnish plain copies of this order to |   |
|                               | the learned advocates for the parties, the Registry is      |   |
|                               | directed to upload this order on the website of the         |   |
|                               | Tribunal forthwith and parties are directed to act on the   |   |
|                               | copies of the order downloaded from the website.            |   |
|                               | (Subesh Kumar Das) (Soumitra Pal)  Member (A). Chairman.    |   |
| Skg.                          |   |   |
|                               |   |   |